

**TATA STEEL FOUNDATION**

**ATHENA**  
INFONOMICS

**Support for Emergency Medical Issues and  
Health Awareness (5020008)**

Evaluation Report



Name of the Project:  
**Support for Emergency Medical Issues and Health Awareness  
(5020008)**

Timeframe of the Project studied  
**2020-2021**

Duration of the Evaluation Assignment  
**March 2023- April 2023**

Location of the evaluated project  
**Jharkhand and Odisha**

Names and/or organisation(s) of the evaluator(s)  
**Athena Infonomics**

Name of organisation commissioning the evaluation  
**Tata Steel Foundation**

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgement</b>	<b>3</b>	MHPL	
<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>4</b>	Tata Steel Foundation	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>	Outputs	
Background		Effectiveness	
Evaluation Objectives and Scope		Sustainability Challenges	
Evaluation Scope		Closure Decision	
Approach			
Theory of Change		<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>9</b>
Methodology			
Planning and designing			
Stakeholder consultation			
Analysis and report writing			
Limitations of the Study			
<b>Evaluation Findings</b>	<b>7</b>		
Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)			
Strategy			
TSF's Mandate and Strategy are driven by the philosophy of its founder			
TSF Strategy in Public Health			
Project Overview			
Alignment of the Project with the Group			
CSR Policy			
Planning, Implementation and Monitoring			
Jharkhand Police Department			

# Acknowledgement

This report documents the findings from an independent evaluation of the project titled, "Support for Emergency Medical Issues and Health Awareness" (5020008) across two states – Jharkhand and Odisha implemented during the years 2020-21. The evaluation was commissioned by Tata Steel Foundation (TSF) and conducted by Athena Infonomics. The evaluation is based on the interviews with relevant stakeholders and a documentary review.

The evaluation team wishes to acknowledge the contribution and support of all those who have been involved in this project. The team especially wishes to acknowledge the following individuals at Tata Steel Foundation whose time and inputs have helped us through this process: Mr. Sourav Roy (Chief Executive Officer), Mr. Ajit Chaudhuri (Head - Strategy), Mr. Rajesh Kumar (Unit Lead - Jamadoba), and Mr Jiren Topno (Head- Tribal Culture and Urban Services).

Input valuation was undertaken by Athena under the guidance of Dr Rajesh Khanna (Project Director) and Mr Puranjit Banerjee (Evaluation Specialist) with support from Ms Shivani Kapoor (Advisor), Ms Trapti M (Consultant) and Ms Shruti Cheriyan (Associate Consultant). This evaluation has greatly benefitted from the interviews and discussions with stakeholders. The evaluation team sincerely thanks all those who participated in the present evaluation for their valuable input and time.

## Authors:

Dr Rajesh Khanna  
Mr Puranjit Banerjee  
Ms Shivani Kapoor  
Ms Trapti M  
Ms Shruti Cheriyan

# Executive Summary

This is an evaluation report of the *Support for Emergency Medical Issues and Health Awareness programme (5020008)*. The evaluation has been conducted between March – April 2023, to verify the justification of the closure decision of the ARMAR and JARMA initiatives. of the programme.

- The public health mandate of Tata Steel Foundation (TSF) aims to ensure that the essential health parameters of the population proximate to Tata Steel Ltd operations are catered through provision of primary healthcare services and enhancing health awareness among the community
- In the financial Year 2013-14, a meeting between the Jharkhand Police, Medica Hospitals Private Ltd (MHPL) and Tata Steel Ltd was chaired by the district administration of East Singhbhum to discuss and plan the provision of medical assistance to the trauma victims of road accidents.
- A collaborative tripartite initiative was undertaken to attend to the road accident victims. As per the agreement drawn, Jharkhand Police was to provide ambulances with drivers, and Medica Hospitals Private Limited (MHPL) was to deploy medical personnel in them along with required medicines. TSF committed to reimburse the cost towards human resources and medicines to Medica Hospitals Private Limited.
- Ranchi and Jamshedpur, were selected for the operations. The projects were named Accident Response and Medical Assistance for Ranchi (ARMAR) and Jamshedpur Accident Response and Medical Assistance (JARMA), respectively.
- Between 2014 (September) and 2020 (March), JARMA responded to 3020 calls. Whereas between 2015 (May) and 2020 (March), ARMAR responded to 5977 calls.
- Both the initiatives were effective in the initial year. ARMAR continued attending above one thousand accident cases till 2019. In 2020, the calls of ARMAR reduced to 266. On the other hand, JARMA's number of calls dropped to 361 in 2017 and further down to 44 in 2020. The number of cases drastically reduced for both projects in 2019.
- It was found that the reason for the drop in the number of calls for ARMAR and JARMA was the introduction of free ambulance services (#108) by the Government of Jharkhand and Zigitza Health in 2017. This service, with its nationwide fleet of ambulances, made ambulance service more accessible to the people of Jharkhand. This led to a reduction in the number of calls to ARMAR and JARMA.
- With the number of calls dropping drastically and the running cost of ambulances remaining static, the average cost of attending a single call increased. This made the projects financially unviable over time.
- MHPL and TSF discussed the matter with the Jharkhand Police in June 2019. After due deliberations, it was decided to discontinue the ARMAR-JARMA ambulance services.
- This decision was implemented immediately, and MHPL was given time until March 2020 to redeploy human resources. Finally, the project was discontinued after completing its services till June 2020.

# Introduction

## Background

The public health mandate of Tata Steel Foundation (TSF) aims to ensure that essential health parameters of the population proximate to Tata Steel Ltd operations are catered to by providing primary healthcare services and enhancing healthcare awareness among the people. TSF provided support for emergency medical issues to the community through Jamshedpur Accident Response & Medical Assistance (JARMA) and Accident Response & Medical Assistance at Ranchi (ARMAR), Amphan cyclone relief etc.

Under a tripartite understanding among Jharkhand Police, Hospitals Private Limited (MHPL) and Tata Steel Ltd, ambulance services would be provided to road accident victims as accident response and medical assistance in Ranchi named ARMAR. TSF funds the operating expenditure of these ambulance services incurred on manpower, telephone bills and medicines consumed. Similarly, there is another tripartite agreement for the same service, but the location is Jamshedpur and its surrounding. This is called Jamshedpur Accident Response and Medical Assistance (JARMA).

In 2017, with the introduction of free ambulance services (#108) by the Government of Jharkhand and Zigitza Health, a sharp decline in the number of cases attended by ARMAR & JARMA was observed. Consequently, per case expenditure increased, making the intervention economically unviable. Subsequently, a joint decision was taken by TSF, MHPL and the Senior Superintendent of Police to close down the operations of the two initiatives.

TSF entrusted Athena Infonomics Private Limited to evaluate and verify the justification of the closure decision of ARMAR and JARMA under the Project "Support for Emergency Medical Issues and Health Awareness Program".

## Evaluation Objectives and Scope

The purpose of the mandatory evaluation is to verify the justification of the closure decision of the ARMAR and JARMA initiatives.

## Evaluation Scope

The scope of the mandatory evaluation is limited within the post-closure review of ARMAR and JARMA initiatives.

## Approach

In cognisance of the scope of the evaluation, the approach was a combination of a process-centric evaluation and outcome assessment. It was essential to assess the various activities and processes - suitability, usefulness and intended and unintended outcomes. The critical part was to evaluate and determine whether the program is beneficial, addressing the need eco-system changes and achieving the objectives. A Theory-Based Evaluation (TBE) was used to determine the outcome impact, progress, and causality of the operation modification and eventual closure.

The overall approach for evaluation included understanding the Project's Theory of Change (ToC), interaction with the stakeholders of the ToC of the Project, collecting data from the stakeholders, and preparing the evaluation report.

The Project "Provide Support for Health Treatment" provides the following ToC for contextual understanding:

# Theory of Change

Athena has developed TOC for Support to Emergency Medical Issues and Health Awareness Program (ARMAR and JARMA) based on a review of documents and consultation with the project team.



## Inputs

Providing support for emergency medical issues to the community at times of catastrophes and incidents requiring immediate, time-bound medical support for increased chances of survival.



## Activities

Provision of ambulance services  
Providing time-bound medical assistance to road accident victims



## Outputs

No. of accident victims tended to/transported to the hospital



## Outcomes

Individuals and families protected from catastrophic health expenditure.  
Increased chance of survival from accidents or other unforeseen catastrophes.



## Impact

Good health and well-being of the people living in the community.  
Increased quality of life  
Reduced inequality  
Addressing poverty

## Methodology

### Planning and designing

The evaluation team planned the evaluation exercise based on understanding the project from the Terms of Reference and initial interactions with the TSF team. A research framework was developed and followed.

Table 1: Research Framework

Focus areas	Areas of inquiry	Stakeholders	Research Instruments
Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Strategy	Long-term CSR strategy of TSF and how the project strategy gets aligned with the broader group-level CSR strategy and themes of TSF	Project Team	In-depth interviews using a checklist
	The overall organisational structure of CSR in TSF and how the current project fits into the overall CSR organisational structure		
Planning, implementation & monitoring	Expected results of the Project and the implementation plan to achieve the results	Project Team	In-depth interview
	Current status of implementation/achievement against the plan	Project Team	Project MIS Project reports / secondary research
	Methods of review and monitoring	Project Team	In-depth interviews
	Resources availability and allocation	Project Team	
Effectiveness and Impact	Process of measuring the effectiveness/impact of the project	Project Team	In-depth interviews
Sustainability	Reasons and justification for withdrawal/closure of the project	Project Team	In-depth interviews
Issues and challenges	Issues and challenges in planning, monitoring, implementation, funding and sustainability	Project Team	In-depth interviews

### Stakeholder consultation

The project team and the management of TSF were consulted to understand the reason for the closure of the two initiatives under the Project.

### Analysis and report writing

The data collected through stakeholders' consultations and from secondary sources

were analysed to find responses to the specific Research Questions, and the report was prepared.

### Limitations of the Study

The initiatives were discontinued in the year 2020. The people involved in actual service delivery and the stakeholders who benefitted from the project were not

available at the time of the evaluation. The study is based on the analysis of secondary data and discussions with the senior management, post the closure of the project.

# Evaluation Findings

## Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Strategy

### TSF's Mandate and Strategy are driven by the philosophy of its founder

In line with the founder's philosophy, Tata Group firmly believes the health and welfare of its people, the community and society are intrinsic to its approach of business. One of the critical Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) objectives of Tata Steel Ltd is to enable sustainable and significant betterment in the well-being of communities proximate to its operating locations.

Tata Steel Foundation is the implementing arm of Tata Steel's commitment to community. Instituted on August 16, 2016, Tata Steel Foundation is a Section 8 company with over 1000 people, across 11 units and two states of Jharkhand and Odisha. In FY23, the Foundation reached 3 million lives through its consolidated program portfolio effectively positioned under Impact and Enterprise pathways on Public Health, Education, Livelihoods, Gender and Community Enterprise, Infrastructure and Tribal Identity, at a commitment of 500 crores.

Tata Steel Foundation (TSF) is responsible for strategizing, planning, implementing and monitoring all CSR activities of Tata Steel. The company allocates at least 2% of its average net profits before taxes of the preceding three years towards CSR activities to sustain and improve a healthy and prosperous environment and the quality of life of the communities it serves. Any surpluses arising out of CSR projects or programs,

or activities are re-deployed back into TSF for conducting the CSR activities and do not form a part of the business company's business profits' CSR and Sustainability Committee guides the CSR initiatives.

In the year 2020-21, Tata Steel had a CSR Committee of the following four members:

- Mr Deepak Kapoor, Independent Director – Chairperson of the CSR Committee
- Mr T V Narendran, CEO & MD, Tata Steel – Member
- Mr Koushik Chatterjee, Executive Director & CFO – Member
- Mr O P Bhatt, Independent Director – Member

An Apex CSR Steering Committee chaired by the Managing Director and comprising the senior management team of Tata Steel conducts a quarterly review of the activities. It monitors achievements against targets set at the beginning of the year.

The Company has set up a CSR Advisory Council, comprising some of the most eminent experts from the academic and developmental domains. The members of the Advisory Council provide macro policy-level inputs that critique, guide, and inform Tata Steel's CSR work.

TSF, the CSR arm of Tata Steel Ltd, works under the guidance of Tata Steel's CSR Committee. The MD (Mr T V Narendran) and the CFO (Mr Koushik Chatterjee) of Tata Steel Ltd sit on the Tata Steel CSR and Sustainability Committee and the Tata Steel Foundation Board.

The committee provides the guidance necessary to ensure the optimum allocation of funds to areas and projects that require aid and assistance.

The actual amount spent by Tata Steel on various CSR Activities is as follows:

**Table 2: Amount spent in CSR**

FY 2019-20	INR 192.7 Crore
FY 2020-21	INR 170.3 Crore plus INR 51 Crore on COVID-19 response
FY 2021-22	INR 254.3 Crore plus INR 151.7 Crore on COVID-19 response
FY 2022-23	INR 468.8 Crore

### TSF Strategy in Public Health

TSF partners with governments and independent organisations worldwide to work towards improving the overall health and hygiene of the community in and around areas where they operate.

The public health mandate of TSF aims to ensure that essential health parameters of the population proximate to Tata Steel's operations are catered to through the provision of primary healthcare services and enhancing healthcare awareness among the people. Under TSF's Public Health Function, accessible healthcare facilities are provided to the marginalised and vulnerable populations in the operational villages and proximate areas.

The current initiatives of ARMAR and JARMA as part of the Project Emergency Medical and Health Awareness as supported under the overall program of "Promoting

Healthcare including preventive healthcare through civic infrastructure & services”, as mentioned previously.

### Project Overview

In the financial Year 2013-14, a meeting between the Jharkhand Police, Medica Hospitals Private Limited and Tata Steel Limited was convened by the district administration of East Singhbhum. The agenda was to deliberate on providing medical assistance to the trauma victims who met with road accidents. It was discussed that people generally do not come forward to help road accident victims due to various legal complications. Whereas to save the lives of road accident victims, the priority would be to take the victim to the nearest hospital without wasting time.

Hence, it was decided to take a collaborative tripartite initiative to attend to such victims. An agreement was arrived at whereby the Jharkhand Police was to provide ambulances with drivers, and Medica Hospitals Private Limited (MHPL) was to deploy medical personnel in them along with required medicines. TSF was to reimburse the cost of human resources and treatment to Medical Hospitals Private Limited.

Based on this agreement, two cities, Ranchi and Jamshedpur, were selected for operation. The Ranchi operation was named Accident Response and Medical Assistance for Ranchi (ARMAR), and the Jamshedpur operation was called Jamshedpur Accident Response and Medical Assistance (JARMA).

### Alignment of the Project with the Group CSR Policy

The project commenced on September 1, 2014. The project aimed to provide immediate medical assistance to road accident trauma victims by transporting them to the nearest hospitals free of cost.

At that point, the Project was part of TSF’s more extensive public Health policy of providing curative healthcare to the people in need within its operational areas of West Singhbhum and Jamshedpur.

### Planning, Implementation and Monitoring

The Project was based on collaborative and partnership modes. TSF’s partners used to perform the actual work, i.e., Medica Hospitals Private Limited (MHPL) and

the Jharkhand Police Department, with financial support from TSF.

A memorandum of understanding (MOU) signed between Jharkhand Police, MHPL and TSF laid down the roles and responsibilities of the parties. As per the MOU, the arrangements between the parties were as follows:

#### Jharkhand Police Department

- Provide the Ambulances with fuel and vehicle maintenance.
- Six ambulances were deployed in the morning services (8 am to 8 pm) and two ambulances at night (8 pm to 8 am).

#### MHPL

- Provide manpower to run the ambulances effectively.
- Provided staff of 29 and 36 medical and other personnel for JARMA and ARMAR, respectively.
- Provide telephones, uniforms, medicines and consumables.

#### Tata Steel Foundation

- Responsibility for reimbursing the cost incurred by MHPL on human resources, telephones, medicines and consumables.

This project functioned smoothly for six years, between 2014 and 2020. The project functioning was monitored by both MHPL and TSF simultaneously.

### Outputs

Between 2014 (September) and 2020 (March), JARMA responded to 3020 calls. Whereas between 2015 (May) and 2020 (March), ARMA responded to 5977 calls. The year-wise numbers of calls attended in the two initiatives are given below:

**Table 3: Number of calls attended**

Year	Total Call Attended	
	JARMA	ARMAR
2014 (Sept - Dec)	374	
2015 (For ARMAR: May-Dec)	1003	852
2016	714	1318
2017	361	1242
2018	311	1202
2019	213	1097
2020 (Till March)	44	266
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>3020</b>	<b>5977</b>

### Effectiveness

Both initiatives were effective in the initial year. ARMAR continued attending above one thousand accident cases till 2019. In 2020 the calls of ARMAR reduced to 266. On the other hand, JARMA’s number of calls dropped to 361 in 2017 and further down to 44 in 2020. The number of cases drastically reduced for both projects in 2019.

This situation invited the team for an evaluation of the project. The study revealed that in 2017 Jharkhand government and Ziqitza Health introduced free ambulance services (#108), which had a state-wide fleet of ambulances. People had access to these government ambulance services, and their placement state-wide at closer points saved time compared to the ARMAR-JARMA ambulances. This phenomenon has affected the calls for accident trauma cases to come down.

### Sustainability Challenges

It was also observed that the cost per case increased drastically due to the increase in fuel prices on one hand and the drop in the number of cases on the other. The annual average expenditure for JARMA and ARMAR was around Rs 57 lakh and Rs 86 Lakh, respectively. In 2020, the average cost for attending a single case was around Rs 1.29 lakh and Rs 32,000 for JARMA and ARMAR, respectively. With the exact average project cost, the cost per case was Rs 5,683 for JARMA in 2015 and for ARMAR, Rs 6,525 in 2016, when the number of cases was the highest. Hence, it was no longer financially viable to run the project after 2019.

### Closure Decision

With the easy availability of the Government Ambulance Services (#108), the number of cases for ARMAR and JARMA reduced drastically, making it financially unviable. MHPL and TSF took up the matter with the Jharkhand Police in June 2019. After due deliberations, it was decided to discontinue the ARMAR-JARMA ambulance services.

# Conclusion

Emergency response is a very important aspect of healthcare services. Ambulance services play a critical role in the delivery of emergency response services. Given the gap in the critical service provision, the medical assistance programs were initiated in the two cities of Jharkhand. The ARMAR and JARMA programs were ensuring the provision and utilisation of the operational ambulances signifying their functionality, access & quality of infrastructure, among other things.

The decision of the State Government to run the state-wide Government ambulance service was a welcome decision for the benefit of the people State, which fulfilled the unmet need for such a service. The evaluation of ARMAR and JARMA noted that the initiatives served their purpose for their duration of operation and were aligned appropriately with the TSF Strategy. However, the drastic drop in cases due to reasons beyond the control of TSF and its partners made the projects unviable. In the altered circumstances, it was appropriate for TSF and its partner organisations to discontinue the project, as it would not have met the viability and sustainability in the long run.

## Contact Us

Dr. Rajesh Khanna  
Director

Email: [rajesh.k@athenainfonomics.com](mailto:rajesh.k@athenainfonomics.com)  
Mobile: +91 98107 20501



Athena Infonomics is a global data solutions group that applies social science research, data analytics, and technology to provide global development leaders with user-centric, context-specific outcomes. Founded in Chennai, India in 2010, Athena now has offices in India, the United States, the United Kingdom, and Kenya, alongside program hubs spanning Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia. Having worked on more than 200 projects across practices with various clients, we have built a reputation for meaningful outcomes delivered by a skilled, energetic, committed, and passionate team. This work is gaining recognition: in 2022 alone, we were included in *The Financial Times*' Asia-Pacific High-Growth Companies list and India's Growth Champions list, compiled by *The Economic Times*.